

Authorship and date of a key South American paper by Phillip P. King (1832)

Eugene V. Coan¹

Santa Barbara Museum of Natural History
2559 Puesta del Sol Road
Santa Barbara, CA 94105-2936 USA
genecoan@gmail.com

Richard E. Petit

806 St. Charles Road
North Myrtle Beach, SC 29582-2846 USA
r.e.petit@att.net

Diego G. Zelaya

División Zoología Invertebrados
Museo de La Plata
Paseo del Bosque s/n
1900 La Plata, ARGENTINA
dzelaya@fcnym.unlp.edu.ar

ABSTRACT

An important paper describing many species of new marine and terrestrial mollusks from southern South America was published in the early 1830s. Its authorship has been attributed either to King and Broderip or to King alone, and its date has been given variously as 1830, 1831, or 1832. We here contend that King alone should be considered its author and that it should be dated as July 1832.

Additional keywords: Patagonia, Tierra del Fuego, malacological literature

INTRODUCTION

At the beginning of the 19th century, a number of expeditions provided the first insights into the knowledge of the fauna from the southern tip of South America and the adjacent Antarctic waters. In this regard, the results of H.M.S. ADVENTURE and BEAGLE represent a pioneer contribution regarding mollusks, brachiopods, and barnacles. A paper describing material from this expedition was published in the penultimate issue of *The Zoological Journal*, Volume 5, Part 19, pages 332–349. The significance of that paper arises in the descriptions of 67 new species, including 14 species of marine bivalves – one of them the commercially important scallop *Zygochlamys patagonicus*, 24 species of marine gastropods, 2 chitons, 18 terrestrial gastropods, 4 freshwater gastropods, 3 barnacles, and 2 brachiopods. In addition, a new gastropod genus, *Marinula*, was introduced. The title of this non-illustrated paper is:

“Description of Cirrhipeda, Conchifera and Mollusca, in a collection formed by the officers of H.M.S. Adventure and Beagle employed between the years 1826 and 1830 in surveying the southern coasts of South America, including the Straits of Magalhaens and the coast of Tierra del Fuego. By

Captain Phillip P. King, R.N., F.R.S., &c., assisted by W. J. Broderip, Esq. F.R.S., &c.”

It will be noted that the “authorship” of this paper was oddly styled, and it has also been assigned various publication dates, both matters addressed here.

AUTHORSHIP

The inclusion of Broderip seems to be an unusually placed acknowledgement, but we have seen similar examples used to emphasize an acknowledgment of a non-author. It is clear from the content of the article that King considered himself to be its author. In the second paragraph of the article, he wrote:

“In the description of the species I have the benefit of the advice and assistance of my friend Mr. Broderip; and to his knowledge of the subject, and the attention which he has devoted to my collection, I owe in a great measure the paper which I have now the satisfaction of presenting to the public through the medium of the *Zoological Journal*” [emphasis supplied].

In several other places in the introduction and elsewhere in the article, King referred to the author of the article as “I”, and on p. 342, King again referred to “my friend, Mr. Broderip”. The running head of the article is “Capt. P. P. King’s Description of Cirrhipedia, Conchifera, and Mollusca.”

It is notable that when Broderip had reason to refer to the species named in this paper, he always showed King alone as author. For example, in a paper read at the Zoological Society of London on 29 February 1832, Broderip (1832: 27) commented under his description of *Chiton setosus* that “This species is very distinct from *Chit. setiger*, King, (*Zool. Journ.* vol. v. p. 338) . . .”; and under *C. frembleii*, Broderip (1832: 28) stated differences between it and “*Chit. setiger*, King”. In the *Penny Cyclopaedia* article on *Helix*, Broderip (1838: 108) mentioned *Marinula* King.

¹ Research Associate

In addition to Broderip, many other authors attributed the taxa described in this paper to simply “King”, among them G. B. Sowerby I (1832), Catlow and Reeve (1845), Agassiz (1848), Carpenter (1857), Iredale (1915), Pfeiffer (1857), Suter (1913), and Thiele (1929).

On the other hand, d’Orbigny (1834–1847), in his *Voyage dans l’Amérique Méridionale*, was inconsistent, crediting some taxa to Broderip and others to King. The frequent usage of “King & Broderip” appears to be a rather recent change in the second half of the 20th century after Sherborn (1922–1933) credited the species to “King & Broderip”. Marincovich (1973) used “King” when referring to the genus *Marinula*, but “King & Broderip” in his Literature Cited. Powell (1960) and Dell (1964) used “King” when referring to some species and “King & Broderip” when referring to others. The usage of “King & Broderip” became more common at the end of 20th century, and is often the current usage (Jonkers, 2003; Osorio, 2002; Pastorino, 2005a, b; Pastorino and Harasewych, 2000; Reid and Osorio, 2000; Signorelli and Pastorino, 2011; Zelaya, 2005; among many others).

A modern work using the same type of assistance acknowledgment is *The American Museum of Natural History Guide to Shells* by W. K. Emerson and M. K. Jacobson (1976), “with the assistance of Harold S. Feinberg and William E. Old, Jr.” The Library of Congress cataloging data has author as William K. Emerson with Morris K. Jacobson as joint author, with Feinberg and Old not mentioned.

Although the *International Code on Zoological Nomenclature’s* Article 50.1 (ICZN, 1999: 52) precludes the use of outside sources to determine authorship, we take the view that attribution to King is inherent in the paper, and that attribution to King by other authors, and especially by Broderip himself, is confirmation of our interpretation of the oddly phrased authorship on the paper. It is therefore our conclusion that King alone should be regarded as author of the paper and of the included taxa.

DATE

The issue of *The Zoological Journal* containing this paper was the penultimate one, and the journal’s operation was not smooth. There is no real dating on this part of the volume. The cover of volume 5 is imprinted “From 1832–1834”, and the bottom of the cover is dated 1835. The Contents page for Part XIX containing this paper is imprinted “July, 1830.–September, 1831.”, which is obviously meaningless. This paper and its contained species have been dated by various authors as 1830, 1831, 1832, and even 1835.

Pilsbry (1911: 525) seems to be the source of the mistaken date of 1830, and this has been followed by some subsequent authors. A footnote in the King paper itself (p. 341) notes that, while the paper was being printed, the September 1831 issue of the *Annales des*

Sciences Naturelles had arrived describing one of the new species, and the type was then altered to accommodate the footnote and to change the species name footnoted. The paper could not thus have appeared until after September 1831.

Evidently, proofs of this paper were made available to some workers soon after September 1831. For example, the barnacle *Elminius leachii* described on page 334 was figured by G. B. Sowerby I in a work that appeared on 4 January 1832. Sowerby (1832: unnumbered) stated that “Capt. King has named the species *Elminius leachii*, see Zool. Journ. vol. V. p. 334.” There is a footnote on page 334 of the *Zoological Journal* article stating that the species had already been named *Elminius kingii* Gray, perhaps too late for the text to be changed, a fact not noted by Sowerby. As noted above, Broderip cited two of King’s chitons in a meeting in February 1832.

For unknown reasons, this issue was withheld and not distributed to subscribers until July 1832. In a review published in November 1832, N. A. Vigors, the editor, noted that it was “published in July last” along with some supplementary plates. This is the date given, without explanation, by Sherborn (1922–1933) in his entries for the included species. Most subsequent authors have followed this (e.g., Jonkers, 2003; Pastorino 2005a, b; Pastorino and Harasewych, 2000; Reid and Osorio, 2000; Signorelli and Pastorino, 2011; Zelaya, 2005; among others).

This paper was evidently King’s only contribution to malacology. He published a number of articles on vertebrates, geography, and meteorology. Most of his material from this key invertebrate paper is in The Natural History Museum in London.

CONCLUSIONS

The authorship of the paper often cited as of “King & Broderip,” is attributable to only P. P. King as are the taxa described therein. The date of the paper should be cited as July 1832.

LITERATURE CITED

- Agassiz, L. 1848. Nomenclatoris zoologici index universalis. Jent et Gassman, Soloduri [Solothurn]. x + 1135 pp.
- Broderip, W.J. 1832. [. . . Mollusca and Conchifera hitherto undescribed, which form part of the collection made by Mr. H. Cuming . . .]. Proceedings of the Zoological Society of London, for 1832[2](16): 25–33 (21 April) [individual species descriptions by W. J. Broderip and by G. B. Sowerby I, combined by the Secretary in one text block].
- Broderip, W.J. 1838. Helicidae. Pp. 104–111, in: C. Knight, The Penny Cyclopaedia of the Society for the Diffusion of Useful Knowledge. C. Knight, London. Vol. 12, 510 pp.
- Carpenter, P.P. 1857. Report on the present state of our knowledge with regard to the Mollusca of the West coast of North America. Report of the British Association for the Advancement of Science for 1856: 159–368, pls. 6–9.
- Catlow A. and L. Reeve. 1845. The conchologist’s nomenclator. Reeve Brothers, London, [1] + viii + 326 pp.

- Dell, R.K. 1964. Antarctic and sub-Antarctic Mollusca: Amphineura, Scaphopoda and Bivalvia. *Discovery Reports* 33: 93–250, pls. 2–7.
- Emerson, W.K. and M.K. Jacobson. 1976. The American Museum of Natural History guide to shells – Nova Scotia to Florida. Alfred A. Knopf, New York. 482 + xviii pp., 46 pls.
- ICZN [International Commission on Zoological Nomenclature]. 1999. International Code of Zoological Nomenclature, 4th ed. International Trust for Zoological Nomenclature, London, xxix + 306 pp.
- Iredale, T. 1915. A commentary of Suter's "Manual of the New Zealand Mollusca." *Transactions of the New Zealand Institute*, 47: 417–497.
- Jonkers, H.A. 2003. Late Cenozoic–Recent Pectinidae (Mollusca: Bivalvia) from the Southern Ocean and neighbouring regions. *Monograph on Marine Mollusca* 5: viii + 1–125.
- King, P.P. 1832 (July). Description of Cirrhipeda, Conchifera and Mollusca, in a collection formed by the officers of H. M.S. Adventure and Beagle employed between the years 1826 and 1830 in surveying the southern coasts of South America, including the Straits of Magalhaens and the coast of Tierra del Fuego ["assisted by W. J. Broderip"]. *Zoological Journal* 5(19): 332–349.
- Marincovich, L. 1973. Intertidal mollusks of Iquique, Chile. *Natural History Museum of Los Angeles County, Science Bulletin* 16: 1–49.
- d'Orbigny, A.D. 1834–1847. *Voyage dans l'Amérique Méridionale . . . exécuté pendant les années 1826 . . . 1833, . . . 5(3)[Mollusques]: xliii + 758, 85 pls. [in Atlas].* Paris (Bertrand) & Strasbourg (Levrault). Pp. 1–48, 73–128, pls. 1, 2, 9–13, 15, 16, 56, 1834 [pls. 1, 2: 14 Nov.]; pp. 49–72, 129–176, pls. 3–8, 17–23, 25, 55, 1835 [pls. 18, 19, 22: 13 March; pl. 4: 18 May; pl. 3: 1 June; pp. 49–72: 23 Nov.]; ; pp. 177–184, pls. 14, 24, 26–28, 30–32, 34, 35, 37, 58, 1836; pls. 33, 36, 1836?; pp. 185–376, pls. 29, 38–52, 57, 1837 [pls. 38, 41: 19 June]; pls. 54, 59–66, 68, 69, 1839; pp. 377–424, pls. 53, 67, 70, 71, 1840; pp. 425–488, pls. 72–76, 80, 1841; pls. 83, 85, 1842; pl. 84, 1842?; pp. 529–600, 1845; pp. 489–528, 601–728, 1846; pp. 729–758, 1847?; pls. 77–79, 81, 82, 1847).
- Osorio R., C. 2002. Moluscos marinos en Chile. *Especies de importancia económica*. Universidad de Chile, Facultad de Ciencias, 212 pp.
- Pastorino, G. 2005a. A revision of the genus *Trophon* Montfort, 1810 (Gastropoda: Muricidae) from southern South America. *The Nautilus* 119: 55–82.
- Pastorino, G. 2005b. Recent Naticidae (Mollusca: Gastropoda) from the Patagonian coast. *The Veliger* 47: 225–258.
- Pastorino, G. and M.G. Harasewych. 2000. A revision of the Patagonian genus *Xymenopsis* Powell, 1951 (Gastropoda: Muricidae). *The Nautilus* 114: 38–58.
- Pfeiffer, L. 1857. Catalogue of Auriculidae, Proserpinidae, and Truncatellidae in the collection of the British Museum. British Museum, London, [ii] + 150 pp.
- Pilsbry, H.A. 1911. Non-marine Mollusca of Patagonia. Reports of the Princeton University expeditions to Patagonia, 1896–1899 3(5): 513–633, pls. 38–47 + 5.
- Powell, A.W.B. 1960. Antarctic and Subantarctic Mollusca. *Records of the Auckland Institute and Museum* 5: 117–193.
- Reid, D.G. and C. Osorio. 2000. The shallow-water marine Mollusca of the Estero Elefantes and Laguna San Rafael, southern Chile. *Bulletin of the Natural History Museum of London (Zoology)* 66 (2): 109–146.
- Sherborn, C.D. 1922–1933. Index Animalium sive index nominum quae ab A.D. MDCCCLVIII generibus et specibus animalium imposita sunt. Section Secunda. A kalendis Ianuariis, MDCCCI usque ad finem Decembris, MDCCCL. British Museum (Natural History), London. [Issued in 33 parts: 1, [i]–cxxxii, 1–128, 1922; 2, 129–384, cxxxiii–cxxxvi, 1923; 3, 385–640, 1923; 4, 641–943, 1924; 5, 945–1196, 1924; 6, 1197–1452, 1925; 7, [cxxxvii]–cxxxix, 1925; 8, 1773–2008, 1925; 9, 2009–2248, 1926; 10, 2249–2568, 1926; 11, 2569–2880, 1926; 12, 2881–3136, 1927; 13, 3137–3392, 1927; 14, 3393–3746, 1927; 15, 3747–3970, 1928; 16, 3971–4194, 1928; 17, 4195–4450, 1928; 18, 4451–4690, 1929; 19, 4691–4930, 1929; 20, 4931–5138, 1929; 21, 5139–5348, 1929; 22, 5349–5701, 1930; 23, 5703–5910, 1930; 24, 5911–6118, 1930; 25, 6119–6358, 1931; 26, 6359–6582, 1931; 27, 6583–6806, 1931; 28, 6807–7056, 1932; 29, [i]–vii, cxxxiii–cxlvi, 1–208, 1932; 30, 209–416, 1932; 31, 417–654, 1932; 32, 655–878, 1933; 33, 879–1098, 1933.]
- Signorelli J.H. and G. Pastorino. 2011. Revision of the magellanic Mactridae Lamarck, 1809 (Bivalvia: Heterodonta). *Zootaxa* 2757: 47–67.
- Sowerby, G.B., I. 1832. Genus *Elminius*. The genera of recent and fossil shells, 36: [2] pp. + unnumbered plate.
- Suter, H. 1913–1915. *Manual of the New Zealand Mollusca*. John Mackay, Wellington. xxiii + 1,120 pp., 1913; *Atlas* 71 pls. [Atlas, 1915]
- Thiele, J. 1929–1935. *Handbuch der systematischen Weichtierkunde*. Gustav Fischer, Jena. 2 vols. [1(1), 1–376 (1929); 1(2), i–vi, 377–778 (1931); 2(3), 779–1,022 (1934); 2(4), i–vi, 1,023–1,154 (1935).]
- Vigors, N.A. 1832. Reviews. Art. 1. Catalogue of works on natural history, lately published, with some notice of those considered the most interesting to British naturalists. . . . *The Zoological Journal*, No. 19. *Magazine of Natural History and Journal of Zoology, Botany, Mineralogy, Geology, and Meteorology* 5(29): 648–649.
- Zelaya, D.G. 2005. The bivalves from the Scotia Arc islands: species richness and faunistic affinities. *Scientia Marina* 69 (Suppl. 2): 113–122.